LFC Hearing Brief



Colleges and the State Can Rightsize and Reimagine Higher Education Through Collaboration and Reform

New Mexico's economy is transitioning to a skills-based economy in which the majority of high-wage jobs demand a college degree. Strategically, New Mexico's "Route-to-66" attainment goal has focused the state's combined efforts to meet those workforce demands, prompting reform or efficiency initiatives from the state Higher Education Department (HED). Launched in 2015 when fewer than half of New Mexico adults had a postsecondary certificate or degree, the goal of HED's Route-to-66 initiative is to have 66 percent of New Mexico adults ages 25 to 64 with a higher education credential by 2030.

New Mexico has lower educational attainment than surrounding states, despite high proportionate spending on (and per-capita access to) higher education. Lower educational attainment is magnified by declining enrollment as leading indicators for potential misalignment in meeting workforce needs. As state revenue and college enrollment decline, colleges and the state will increasingly need to strategically prioritize and efficiently leverage their finite resources.

Despite an increasing number of high school graduates in New Mexico, pre-Covid-19 enrollment into public colleges and universities has declined by 13 percent over the past five years, when college enrollments have increased in surrounding states. Texas increased its enrollment by 22 percent, as one example. Declining enrollment is a threat to the state's ability to develop its workforce. Improving the data on recruitment of New Mexico high school graduates can provide greater understanding to reverse the enrollment trend. For instance, UNM's freshman class decreased by 13.4 percent over the past five years, from 3,132 to 2,653, with New Mexico students representing the largest share of the decline. UNM has been losing enrollment from its traditional local Albuquerque high schools

Rightsizing Amid Declining Enrollment

Beginning in mid-March 2020, many colleges across the state shifted to onlineonly learning almost overnight, a response to the coronavirus pandemic. Going forward in 2020 in the face of uncertainty with a resurgence of the coronavirus and the challenges of quickly evolving logistical concerns, institutional leaders reopened college campuses differently. The majority of New Mexico two-year colleges are offering online-only education with limited physical access to campus facilities; the state's four-year universities (with the exception of Northern New Mexico College) are opening their campus physically, under strict protocols, and are offering both online and physical in-person activities.

College enrollment in New Mexico has declined precipitously for several years in New Mexico, as previously identified in the 2017 LFC program evaluation *Higher Education Cost Drivers and Cost-Savings*. College enrollment is a leading indicator for statewide goals of educational attainment and workforce sufficiency. More importantly, the state Legislature has invested heavily in higher education to support New Mexico adults in obtaining college degrees affordably. New Mexico has the third lowest cost of tuition nationally.

AGENCY: Higher Education Institutions

DATE: October 28, 2020

PURPOSE OF HEARING:

Brief on New Mexico higher education enrollment, rightsizing, collaboration, and performance

PREPARED BY: Mark

Valenzuela, LFC Principal Analyst; Clayton Lobaugh, LFC Program Evaluator

No high school diploma



High school diploma

Texas Arizona New Mexico U.S. Colorado

Some college, no degree





Bachelor's degree or higher



Source: 2019 US Census

Despite low tuition costs and strong state support, fewer students are attending New Mexico higher education institutions (HEIs) because of student choices and long-term population trends. For the five-year period (2015 - 2019) preceding the coronavirus pandemic, enrollment declined by 13 percent, or 16,444 students, and impacted institutions evenly, two-year colleges represented 53 percent of the declining student population.

Table 1. New Mexico 10-Year PopulationChange by Age Demographic, 2010-2019

| Population | 2010 | 2019 | Change | | |
|----------------------|-----------|-----------|----------|-----|--|
| Population | 2010 | 2019 | # | % | |
| Under 18 years | 518,672 | 475,838 | (42,834) | -8% | |
| 18 to 24 years | 203,539 | 195,875 | (7,664) | -4% | |
| 25 to 44 years | 515,768 | 538,933 | 23,165 | 4% | |
| 45 to 64 years | 548,945 | 508,577 | (40,368) | -7% | |
| 65 years and over | 272,255 | 377,606 | 105,351 | 39% | |
| Total | 2,059,179 | 2,096,829 | 37,650 | 2% | |

Source: LFC analysis of U.S. Census Bureau data.

New Mexico's current population trends suggest that enrollment declines will continue unless recruitment and retention improve. According to U.S. Census Bureau population data, people under age 18 decreased by 42.8 thousand (8 percent) and people age 18-24 decreased by 7.7 thousand (4 percent) from 2010 to 2019. Additionally, the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE) released data in 2016 projecting that the number of New Mexico high school graduates would drop significantly below current levels by 2032.¹ Past LFC analyses have also found that the state's birth to age 5 population decreased by 31 thousand (or 20 percent) from 152 thousand in 2009 to 121 thousand in 2019.

If these trends continue into the future and further decrease college enrollment, New Mexico's 24 state-funded colleges and universities will need to adapt in two key ways. First, the state's colleges and universities will need to become more streamlined and collaborative in the use of finite resources for instruction, administration, and capital outlay. Second, the state's colleges and universities will need to aggressively improve their recruitment and retention of resident and outof-state students.

Future Revenues for the State and Higher Education Remain Uncertain

A 2020 economic recession, prompted by the coronavirus pandemic and an oil and gas market downturn, has reduced New Mexico's available general fund revenues. During the June 2020 special legislative session, the Legislature enacted solvency



measures to balance the state budget for FY20 and FY21. Specifically, the Legislature reduced general fund appropriations, transferred funding from reserves, swept fund balances, and authorized the use of \$750 million in federal stimulus revenues for FY21.

As of September 2020, New Mexico's Consensus Revenue Estimating Group (CREG) anticipated recurring general fund revenues for FY21 to be between \$7.3 billion (a 5 percent decrease from FY20) and \$6.4 billion (a 19 percent decrease from FY20). The CREG estimated total general fund revenues for FY21 could decline 7 percent to 19 percent from FY20. The state's revenue outlook for FY21 and FY22 is uncertain and will depend on the path of the pandemic, consumer spending, employment recovery, and the oil and gas markets.

¹ WICHE. (2016). "Knocking at the College Door." Retrieved from <u>https://knocking.wiche.edu/data</u>

The Legislature has maintained strong financial support for higher education institutions (HEIs), and in particular, their students. New Mexico HEIs received \$1.4 billion in total unrestricted (discretionary) instruction and general (I&G) revenues in FY20. State funding constituted 51 percent (\$703 million) of total unrestricted I&G revenue in FY20 overall, but reliance on the state's share of funding varies significantly across different HEIs.



Across different HEIs, state funding as a

proportion of total unrestricted I&G revenue ranged from a high of 80 percent at Mesalands Community College to a low of 13 percent at New Mexico Junior College. The second largest I&G revenue source for HEIs came from total tuition and fees (\$391 million), which made up 28 percent of total unrestricted I&G revenue.

According to HEI financial reports of actuals submitted to HED, HEI unrestricted operational fund balances reached a peak of \$474 million in FY20. From FY07 to FY20, unrestricted operational fund balances increased by \$247 million (or 109

percent) across the state's higher education system. These data indicate that higher education fund balances in **FY20** were double pre-Great Recession levels. Appendix D includes additional detail.

| | Table 2. New Mexico Higher Education | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|--|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|----------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|------------|
| | End-of-Year Operational Fund Balances, FY07-FY20 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | (in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| l | Fiscal Year | FY07 | FY08 | FY09 | FY10 | FY11 | FY12 | FY13 | FY14 | FY15 | FY16 | FY17 | FY18 | FY19 | FY20 |
| | I&G Funds | \$91.8 | \$115.4 | \$115.6 | \$127.6 | \$151.6 | \$156.7 | \$144.6 | \$139.2 | \$140.6 | \$159.7 | \$145.9 | \$170.4 | \$189.6 | \$235.8 |
| | Other Funds | \$135.3 | \$141.1 | \$149.1 | \$140.3 | \$162.3 | \$160.6 | \$160.1 | \$158.9 | \$168.4 | \$175.0 | \$168.2 | \$180.1 | \$197.5 | \$238.5 |
| | Total | \$227.1 | \$256.5 | \$264.7 | \$267.9 | \$313.8 | \$317.3 | \$304.7 | \$298.1 | \$308.9 | \$334.7 | \$314.1 | \$350.5 | \$387.1 | \$474.3 |
| | | | | | | | | | Source | e IEC an | alveis of H | El financia | l renorts o | f actuals (l | =vhihit 1) |

Notes: Chart only includes unrestricted (discretionary) funds.

New Mexico commits a higher percentage of its tax and lottery revenues to higher education than all other states, except Alaska and Wyoming. According to the latest available finance report from the State Higher Education Executive Officers Association (SHEEO), New Mexico allocated 11.4 percent of its total tax and lottery revenue to higher education in FY17 which was the third highest percentage in the country behind Alaska (11.7 percent) and Wyoming (15.2 percent). Appendix E includes additional detail.

Higher Education Credential Production Has Increased, but Spending Per-Credential Suggests Room for More Efficiency

The state and HEIs have placed an increased policy emphasis on student success and credential completion in recent years, including the creation of an outcomesbased higher education funding formula in FY13. The data suggests that this policy focus has increased credential completion and graduation rates. For example, statewide credential production from 2010-11 to 2019-20 increased by 4.8 thousand degrees and certificates (25 percent). Additionally, the University of New Mexico (UNM) main campus increased its four-year graduation rate from 19 percent for the 2011 first-time, freshman cohort to 34 percent for the 2015 freshman cohort. Similarly, New Mexico State University (NMSU) main campus

Chart 3. Credentials from State-Funded New Mexico HEIs



increased its four-year graduation rate from 18 percent for the 2011 cohort to 26 percent for the 2015 cohort.



Source: LFC analysis of FY20 HEI financial reports of actuals data (Exhibit 2) and preliminary FY20 total credential awards data for the HED I&G funding formula.

However, I&G spending per credential varies considerably across HEIs from \$19.7 thousand per credential to \$161.5 thousand per credential which suggests room for additional efficiencies in New Mexico higher education.

HED and Colleges Need to Collaborate to Finish the "Trifecta" of Articulation and Transfer Reform

In 2016, HED began implementing the trifecta reform initiative, intended to simplify the transfer of lower-level courses among HEIs. The three-pronged program developed (1) a common-course numbering system (CCNS), (2) a revised general education curriculum, and (3) meta-majors designed to assist students in maintaining progress toward

degree completion even if students transferred to another institution. The reform program is incomplete, and may be impeding student progress to degree completion.

| Offered and Accepted Across All State Funded HEIs | | | | | | | |
|---|---------------------------|---------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Number of State HEIs | New Mexico Common Courses | | | | | | |
| Offering/Accepting the Common Course | Number of Courses | Percent | | | | | |
| 24 All HEIs | 6 | 0.2% | | | | | |
| 19 to 23 HEIs | 46 | 1.7% | | | | | |
| 13 to 18 HEIs | 76 | 2.9% | | | | | |
| 7 to 12 HEIs | 194 | 7.3% | | | | | |
| 4 to 6 HEIs | 546 | 20.7% | | | | | |
| 1 to 3 HEIs | 1,775 | 67.2% | | | | | |
| | 2,643 | 100.0% | | | | | |

Table 3. New Mexico Common Courses fered and Accepted Across All State Funded HE

> officers to find commonality in learning outcomes among the same lower-level courses such as college algebra, biology and English. The result was a database of 2,643 lower-level courses, of which only 6 courses are offered by all 24 state-funded HEIs. Almost 70 percent of the courses in the CCNS are offered only by one institution, which highlights the problem that institutions perceive their general courses to be unique in learning outcomes. HED, as a regulator, can enforce discipline to simplify this system.

> > Similar courses can be split into multiple courses within the higher education CCNS if HEI faculty do not agree that courses are similar. For example, Calculus I is counted in the CCNS as three different courses (MATH 1510, MATH 1511, and MATH 1512) because

> > The Western Interstate Commission for Higher

The CCNS, designed by faculty, academic officers, and registrars

from throughout the state, cataloged lower-level courses offered by institutions. In theory, the exercise was designed to allow academic

Source: LFC analysis of HED Common Course Matrix (September 2020)

| Course Name | Common Course Number | Number of HEIs | HEIs |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------|--|
| Calculus I | MATH 1510 | 16 | CNM, ENMU-Main, ENMU-RO, ENMU- RU, LCC, NMHU, NMJC, NMT, NNMC, SFCC, SJC, UNM- GA, UNM-LA, UNM- TA, UNM-VA, WNMU |
| Calculus and Analytic Geometry I | MATH 1511 | 5 | NMSU-Main, NMSU- AL, NMSU-CA, NMSU DA, NMSU-GR. |
| Calculus I | MATH 1512 | 1 | UNM-Main |

 Table 4. New Mexico Common Course Numbers for Calculus I

NMSU-Main, NMSU-AL, NMSU-CA, NMSU-DA, NMSU-GR. UNM-Main

Source: LFC analysis of HED Common Course Matrix (September 2020)

WICHE worked with more than 100 institutions to standardize learning outcomes to make transfers easy for students. WICHE's program, called the Interstate Passport®, includes only one institution in New Mexico. Education (WICHE) addressed similar issues with its Interstate Passport® program. The Interstate Passport® program contains 63 learning outcomes – designed by faculty from multiple western states for block transfer of lower division general education courses. Faculty agreed the program is congruent with and covers the same learning outcomes. Only NMSU participates in the Interstate Passport program.

In New Mexico, if the trifecta had achieved its stated purpose – to simplify transferability of common courses and learning outcomes – the entire general education curriculum would be aligned across all 24 public institutions. Unique

courses, which make up more than 88 percent of lower-level courses, would be the exceptions. In other words, a calculus course at NMSU would have the same learning outcomes as at UNM.

A database of 2,643 lower-level courses does not fulfill the purpose of the trifecta initiative. Some institutions own an inordinate amount of courses in the CCNS. In October, HED announced a renewed focus on completing the trifecta reforms, particularly the CCNS and normalizing general education learning outcomes among institutions. The state *Postsecondary Education Articulation Act* (Section 21-1B-1 NMSA 1978) provides HED with authority to require compliance of HEIs. The Act also requires HED to provide LFC with an annual report on the status of the trifecta reforms, which the LFC has not received since the implementation of the trifecta.

Inter-institutional Online Course Sharing. HEIs could also potentially save money and increase student access to courses through interinstitutional online course sharing. Some college courses in the New Mexico common course numbering system are aligned across all (or nearly all) 24 state HEIs, such as College Algebra or English Composition I. Interinstitutional online course sharing could be a way for HEIs to share instructional services and increase course access to college students. As a small-scale hypothetical example, if each state HEI offered only three online College Algebra course sections per year (one for each semester), online course sharing could potentially save HEIs \$120 thousand per year while still serving the same total number of students and increasing class sizes by 5 students.

Chart 5. Common Course Numbering System by HEI, 2020



Source: LFC analysis of HED common course maxtrix (September 2020)

| Table 5. Hypothetical Cost of College Algebra Courses | |
|---|--|
| with and without Online Course Sharing | |

| _ | No Course | Course | Change from Sharing | | |
|---|-----------|-----------|---------------------|---------|--|
| Category | Sharing | Sharing | Amount | Percent | |
| Number of Online College Algebra Courses (24 HEIs, 3 semesters, 1 course per semester) | 72 | 60 | -12 | -17% | |
| Est. Instructor Salary per Online Course (\$60 thousand salary, 6 courses per year) | \$10,000 | \$10,000 | 0 | 0% | |
| Students per Online Course | 25 | 30 | 5 | 20% | |
| Total Student Served | 1,800 | 1,800 | 0 | 0% | |
| Total Instructor Cost | \$720,000 | \$600,000 | -\$120,000 | -17% | |

Rightsizing through Academic Program Approval Reform

Academic programs offered by public colleges and universities may reflect similar foundational concerns as the CCNS. New Mexico offers 120 programs per 100,000 adults compared with Texas, who offers 43 programs per 100,000 adults. New Mexico offers three times the number of academic degree programs as Texas and almost double the number of Arizona. Appendix H has more detail.

One additional observation on academic programs relates to the college mission and the types of programs offered. In Texas and in Arizona, four-year universities do not offer associates degrees and likewise, two-year colleges do not offer bachelor's degrees. New Mexico institutions have a broad array of academic programs offered by the two-year and four-year sector. Combined, New Mexico New Mexico has more HEIs and academic programs, relative to population size, than surrounding states

HEIs could potentially save money and increase student access to courses through online course sharing

Source: LFC analysis

offers 88 doctoral programs, 216 masters degrees, 368 bachelor degrees, 578 associates degrees and 701 certificate programs.



Source: LFC analysis of U.S. Census, IPEDS, Higher Learning Commission, Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board, and HEI information.



Source: HED Funding Formula, 2020

| Table 6. New M | lexico Academic Pr | ogram Offerings and | Total Awards |
|----------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------------|
| | | ogram onernigs and | |

| Higher Education Institutions | Doctoral Degrees | Masters Degrees | Bachelors Degrees | Associates Degrees | Certificate Programs | Total |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--------|
| NMT | 10 | 19 | 23 | 2 | 5 | 59 |
| UNM System | 47 | 89 | 104 | 92 | 113 | 445 |
| NMSU System | 31 | 63 | 96 | 108 | 76 | 374 |
| ENMU System | - | 13 | 55 | 61 | 73 | 202 |
| NMHU | - | 20 | 37 | 4 | 24 | 85 |
| NNMC | - | - | 10 | 21 | 15 | 46 |
| WNMU | - | 12 | 43 | 16 | 42 | 113 |
| CNM | - | - | - | 76 | 105 | 181 |
| CCC | - | - | - | 22 | 44 | 66 |
| LCC | - | - | - | 16 | 17 | 33 |
| MCC | - | - | - | 16 | 11 | 27 |
| NMJC | - | - | - | 13 | 26 | 39 |
| SJC | - | - | - | 72 | 60 | 132 |
| SFCC | - | - | - | 59 | 90 | 149 |
| Total | 88 | 216 | 368 | 578 | 701 | 1,951 |
| 2020 Awards | 562 | 2,779 | 7,565 | 7,459 | 5,629 | 23,994 |

Source: LFC analysis of HEI profiles on Higher Learning Commission website (compiled October 2020). Total awards (i.e. credentials awarded) data from HED I&G funding formula.

Last year, the number of postsecondary credentials awarded (i.e. awards) declined by 3.4 percent, the most significant reduction since the introduction of the outcomes-based funding formula. Most concerning, bachelor's degrees dropped by 6 percent over the past five years, when sub-baccalaureate certificates increased by 42 percent during the same time period. According to U.S. Census Bureau data, New Mexico had lower degree attainment than Texas, Arizona, Colorado, and the U.S. average.

Directionally, the growth in awards is misaligned with industry needs; the majority of growth in total awards is driven by sub-baccalaureate certificates earned at twoyear colleges, a fact highlighted in the 2018 LFC Program Evaluation *Review of the Higher Education Funding Formula*. Producing more sub-baccalaureate certificates is not fully meeting industry workforce needs, which often require a minimum of a bachelor's degree. Given the number of academic programs per capita, New Mexico's resources may be stretched too thin to align with industry needs.

Under its statutory authority, HED could require colleges and universities to provide copies of their regular academic program reviews to the state. Arizona requires an academic degree program be assessed every seven years and for the review to be submitted to the state. Texas has a state process to identify lowproducing programs and then recommend the closure or consolidation of consistently low-producing programs. Similar programs in New Mexico do not exist at the state level.

Academic Program Approval in New Mexico. To be eligible for state funding, an institution must seek approval of a new degree program from its governing board, HED's Higher Education Advisory Committee, and the HED cabinet secretary. The legislative branch has modest input into the state approval process except for one member (the LFC director or designee) on the nine-member advisory committee. A process to close or consolidate academic programs does not exist.

State law and HED rules do not require state approval for new undergraduate certificate programs, even though certificate program education has grown significantly. From FY16 to FY20, the number of undergraduate certificate credentials counted in the higher education I&G funding formula increased by 1.6 thousand certificates (or 42 percent) from 3.9 thousand certificates in FY16 to 5.5 thousand certificates in FY20. The 2017 LFC *Higher Education Cost Drivers* program evaluation recommended increased oversight and quality assurance of certificate programs.

A state law requires the Board of Finance (a bond issuing entity) to approve new graduate degree programs. State law says that New Mexico's four-year HEIs cannot use state funding for any new graduate degree programs without first receiving approval from the state Board of Finance (Section 21-1-24 NMSA 1978). According to meeting documentation from January 2015 through September 2020, the state Board of Finance approved 100 percent of the 19 new graduate degree programs presented to the board for approval. The Legislature could consider modifying this law, or HED could consider promulgating rules, to set additional guidelines for program approval such as HEI program-to-enrollment ratio thresholds. HED could also re-review programs 5 years after initial approval to see if projected enrollment met original estimates.

Case Study: Low Producing Program Reviews in Texas

The Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board (THECB) annually reviews the size of academic programs and biennially makes recommendations to HEI governing boards about the consolidation or closure of small programs. Academic programs with a small cumulative number of graduates over a rolling 5-year timeframe are defined by the THECB as "low-producing" programs. Texas HEIs have the option to ignore any THECB recommendations to close or consolidate low-producing programs. However, HEIs ignoring these recommendations are then required to identify their retained low-producing programs during any legislative appropriation requests. According to the THECB, Texas HEIs chose to voluntarily close or consolidate 654 small academic programs from 2010 through 2018 since the inception of low-producing program reviews.

Source: http://reportcenter.highered.texas.gov/agency-publication/guidelines-manuals/lowproducing-degree-program-review-january-2020/ State law and HED rules do not require state approval for new undergraduate certificate programs, even though certificate program education has grown significantly

A state law requires the Board of Finance (a bond issuing entity) to approve new graduate degree programs

Colleges can Leverage Online Education, Shared Services, and Technology



Source: LFC analysis of National Center for Education Statisics data. Note: Fall enrollment in this chart is student headcount.

Students at public colleges and universities across the U.S. have been taking more online classes in recent years. According to data from the U.S. National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), the number of students choosing to take some or all of their college courses online has been continuously increasing over the past seven years of available NCES data. From Fall 2012 to Fall 2018, students taking all online classes increased by 558 thousand (45 percent), students taking some online classes increased by 748 thousand (31 percent), and students taking no online classes decreased by 1.3 million (15 percent).

In New Mexico higher education, online education and square footage per student were increasing even prior to the Covid-19 pandemic. The 2017 LFC *Higher Education Cost Drivers* program evaluation found that institutional square footage increased by 38 percent between 2009 and 2015. From 2016 to 2019, the total I&G square footage of New Mexico's state-funded HEIs remained relatively flat with

Table 7. Higher Education I&G Square Feet (Sq.Ft.) per In-Person Student Full-Time Enrollment (FTE).

| Мессика | 2016 | 2019 | Change | | |
|------------------------------|------------|------------|----------|------|--|
| Measure | 2016 | 2019 | # | % | |
| I&G Sq.Ft. | 19,283,801 | 19,360,261 | 76,460 | 0.4% | |
| Fall In-Person FTE | 69,193 | 56,277 | (12,916) | -19% | |
| Fall Online FTE | 15,273 | 18,321 | 3,048 | 20% | |
| I&G Sq.Ft. per In-Person FTE | 279 | 344 | 65 | 23% | |

Source: LFC analysis of HED enrollment and capital outlay data. Note: Student FTE is calculated by dividing total undergraduate

student credit hours (SCH) by 15 and total graduate SCH by 12.

an increase of 0.4 percent (or 76.5 thousand square feet). At the same time, online full-time enrollment (FTE) increased by 20 percent (or 3 thousand) while in-person student FTE decreased by 19 percent (or 12.9 thousand). All of these trends together had the effect of increasing the I&G square footage per student. The number of total I&G square feet per inperson student FTE increased by 23 percent (or 65 square feet per student FTE) from 279 square feet per student FTE in 2016 to 344 square feet per student FTE in 2019.

As a case study, the Florida Legislature created a statewide "virtual campus" providing shared online services for HEIs and students in 2012. The Florida Virtual Campus provides shared statewide services for online learning, articulation and transfer, career advising, academic advising, and library services to 12 public universities, 28 community colleges, and 74 K-12 school districts. According to a 2019 annual report, the shared services provided by the Florida Virtual Campus saved HEIs \$318.6 million in operating costs in 2018. In the same year, the Florida Virtual Campus also helped HEIs access, develop, and share open educational resources (public domain instructional materials) which saved students an estimated \$5 million in aggregate textbook costs.²

The Florida Legislature created a statewide "virtual campus" providing shared online services for HEIs, which saved HEIs \$319 million in operational costs and students \$5 million in textbook costs in 2018

² Complete Florida Plus Program. (2019). *Complete Florida Plus Program 2019 Annual Report*. p.10. Retrieved from <u>https://www.flvc.org/annual-reports</u>

Consortia and Partnerships Can Add Value and Create Cost-Savings

The Western Cooperative for Educational Technologies (WCET) found consortia can add value to HEIs by increasing: student access and success, centralized service management, cost-savings, and opportunities for collaborative innovation. Consortia can do this through shared administrative, academic, technology, and student services.³ Past LFC research has recommended that HEIs participate in consortia and collaborate to achieve cost-savings through group purchasing, shared space, and reduction of duplicate programs.⁴

The consortium model varies across different systems and partnerships. For example, the five-campus University of Massachusetts system launched efforts in

2009 to engage in shared procurement which has led to \$14 million in savings.⁵ The Boston Consortium of Higher Education, a partnership between 19 HEIs including Harvard University and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, provides shared internal audit, risk management, and travel services.⁶

New Mexico HEIs could create consortia bv strengthening existing partnerships and creating new ones. Existing higher education associations and professional organizations could work to increase efficiencies. For example, HEI registrars could collaborate to create a uniform statewide college application for New Mexico HEIs or a statewide articulation and transfer agreement. Formalized collaborations between the state's HEIs would also make it easier for HED and HEIs to address statewide higher education policy issues.

New Mexico Independent Community Colleges (NMICC) is developing a pilot project to standardize Enterprise, Resource, and Planning (ERP) technology systems and share services across seven HEIs.⁷ The initial cost for this project is anticipated to be \$8.7 million dollars in FY22 with \$3.1 million requested from the state general fund and \$5.6 million in local funds. The long-term cost savings from this project have not yet been estimated. However, the seven HEIs who plan to participate in this project spent a combined \$107 million on support services in FY20.

Table 8. Potential Collaboration Deliverables from New Mexico Higher Education Entities

Figure 1. Consortia Can Add

Value to Member HEIs by Increasing:

Student Access and Success;

Opportunities for Collaborative

Source: 2018 WCET Consortia Survey (p.12)

Cost-Savings; and

Innovation.

Centralized Service Management;

| Entity | Existence | Potential Collaboration Deliverables |
|---|-------------------|--|
| Higher Education Department (HED) and New Mexico Higher Education Associations | Exist | Initiation and facilitation of shared services across HEIs and higher education sectors |
| New Mexico Association of Collegiate Registrars & Admissions Officers | Exists | Statewide college application; statewide articulation and transfer agreement; |
| New Mexico Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators | Exists | Aligned and simplified financial aid processes |
| New Mexico Association of Institutional Research and Planning | Exists | Uniform data definitions across institutions; joint data analytics; technology requests, |
| New Mexico Association of Chief Academic Officers | Does Not Exist | Expansion of common courses and alignment of student learning objectives in common courses |
| New Mexico Association of College and University Business Officers | Does Not Exist | Joint purchases or shared services |

Source: Association websites and LFC files.

New Mexico Independent Community Colleges (NMICC) is developing a pilot project to standardize business management systems and share services across seven HEIs

https://www.nmlegis.gov/Entity/LFC/Documents/Program_Evaluation_Reports/Program%20Evaluation%20Hi gher%20Education%20Cost%20Drivers%20and%20Cost%20Savings.pdf

⁶ Retrieved from https://www.boston-consortium.org

³ Poulin, R. & Straut, T. (2018). WCET. "Together We Can Accomplish More: A Survey of Multi-Institution Consortia and System Leaders." Retrieved from https://wcet.wiche.edu/sites/default/files/Consortium-and-System-Leader-Survey-Report.pdf ⁴ Legislative Finance Committee. (2017). "Program Evaluation: Higher Education Cost Drivers and Cost

Savings." Report #17-02. p.38. Retrieved from

⁵ Nero, D. (May/June 2020). "Multicampus Shared Services." Business Officer. National Association of College and University Business Officers. Retrieved from

https://www.businessofficermagazine.org/departments/multicampus-shared-services/

⁷ The seven HEIs that plan to participate in this consortium are: Clovis Community College (CCC), Central New Mexico Community College (CNM), Luna Community College (LCC), Mesalands Community College (MCC), Northern New Mexico College (NNMC), Santa Fe Community College (SFCC), and San Juan College (SJC).

The Legislature should consider amending the state laws governing the computer systems enhancement fund to allow colleges to submit collaborative projects through the state process

New Mexico State University (NMSU) recently initiated an administrative re-structuring of its Alamogordo, Carlsbad, and Grants branch campuses

Higher education RPSPs increased by 30 percent in 5 years to 146 projects which indicates that RPSPs could be an area for additional review and efficiency



One limitation to funding statewide joint projects is the funding mechanism to support collaborative initiatives such as the shared services ERP project of the NMICC member institutions. Typically, the state would fund systems like this through the computer systems enhancement fund (CSEF), however those projects are driven by state agencies. In this case, the LFC recommended, and HED accepted, that the shared services project be funded through the CSEF with the HED as sponsor. The Legislature should consider amending the statutes governing the CSEF to allow colleges and universities to submit shared collaborative projects through the state process.

New Mexico State University (NMSU) recently initiated an administrative restructuring of its Alamogordo, Carlsbad, and Grants branch campuses. In 2020, NMSU announced the president positions at the three branch campuses would be consolidated into one position. Consolidating these positions will annually save NMSU an estimated \$307 thousand. Through shared services and online education, other HEI systems (such as the UNM system and the ENMU system) will likely need to examine similar branch campus restructuring and streamlining. The 2017 LFC program evaluation, *Higher Education Cost Drivers and Cost Savings*, recommended aggregating main campus and branch campus appropriations in the state budget to give HEIs more budgetary flexibility to streamline inter-campus operations.

Revisiting Research and Public Service Project Oversight

The state funds research and public service projects (RPSPs) at HEIs through lineitem appropriations in the state budget. Higher education RPSPs increased by 30 percent in 5 years to 146 projects which indicates that RPSPs could be an area for additional review and efficiency. From FY17 to FY21, state funding for RPSPs increased by \$13 million (10 percent) from \$122 million in FY17 to \$134 million in FY21. Over the same timeframe, the number of RPSPs increased by 34 projects from 112 RPSPs in FY17 to 146 RPSPs in FY21. In FY21, 89 out of 146 RPSP line-item appropriations (or 61 percent) were for less than \$300 thousand which indicates that most RPSP funding is for small initiatives at HEIs.

To increase the scale, efficiency, and potential effectiveness of these various RPSP initiatives, HEIs and HED should review whether RPSPs could be incorporated into general I&G operations or better aligned with other similar programs. In 2017, HED staff identified 62 instruction-related RPSP line-item appropriations that could potentially be aggregated into HEIs' overall I&G appropriations to reduce additional reporting and administration. However, no RPSP line-item appropriations during the 2017 regular and special legislative sessions.

Past LFC research has identified issues with the overuse of RPSP line-item appropriations and recommended

stronger review at the institutional and state levels. A 2008 LFC program evaluation, *Review of Selected Research and Public Service Projects*, found that the RPSP budget process is not being exclusively used to support research and

public service projects, but is often used to supplement I&G functions. The report noted that "growing use of RPSPs to fund operations... creates administrative burdens" and that "the numerous small dollar appropriations make it practically impossible for HED to effectively monitor and provide oversight" (p.3).

Increasing Financial Aid Opportunities for Students

New Mexico offers broad support to students to ensure a postsecondary education is accessible and affordable for every college-bound New Mexican. According to the National Center for Higher Education Management Systems (NCHEMS), New Mexico provides the sixth highest level of state financial support in the country to public colleges and universities. Moreover, according to SHEEO data, New Mexico tuition and fee costs remain the third lowest in the country.

Each year, college students receive \$600 million in financial aid support – 51 percent from grants, 12 percent from scholarships, 35 percent from loans, and 2 percent from work-study – with students from the lowest incomes accruing 71 percent of the support. Despite this, fewer New Mexico college-bound students – recent high school graduates or returning adult learners -- are choosing to attend New Mexico's HEIs, according to college enrollment data collected by HED.

The concern for New Mexico policymakers is that several research studies show a widening postsecondary attainment gap contributes to growing economic inequality. The same studies illustrate a household income's outsized influence on student success; top performing low- and middle-income students earn bachelor's degrees at the same rate as low performing high-income students. In addition, low and middle-income students are less likely to attend college.

New Mexico College Graduate Retention and Employment Outcomes

New Mexico's workforce has lower higher educational attainment than its surrounding states and the U.S. in general. New Mexico has increased its educational attainment over the past 10 years. From 2010 to 2019, the percent of New Mexico's population age 25 years or older with an associate's degree or higher increased from 32 percent in 2010 to 37 percent in 2019. New Mexico's increased educational attainment is likely due to an increased emphasis on higher education outcomes and performance.



Source: LFC analysis of U.S. Census Bureau data (Table S1501).

Despite New Mexico's growth in educational attainment, surrounding states and the U.S. have higher levels of educational attainment. According to U.S. Census Bureau data, New Mexico had lower degree attainment than Texas, Arizona, Colorado, and the U.S. average. These data suggest that New Mexico's comparatively high per-capita access to higher education is not resulting in higher educational attainment than other states with lower per-capita access to higher education.

Over the past 10 years of available data, 44.4 thousand more people moved from New Mexico to other states than came to New Mexico from other states. The Over the past 10 years of available data, 44.4 thousand more people moved from New Mexico to other states than came to New Mexico from other states

New Mexico's tuition and fee costs remain the third lowest in the country migration of workers to other states is potentially a reason why New Mexico's educational attainment remains low. According to the 2020 Workforce Solutions Department *State of the Workforce Report*, a net total of 14.4 thousand people migrated from New Mexico to other states in 2018 (the most current data available).⁸ More people moved out of New Mexico to other states than moved into New Mexico from other states in 8 of the past 10 years of available data. A 2016 LFC program evaluation, *STEM Degree Production and Employment Outcomes*, found that science, technology, engineering, and math (STEM) graduates with higher levels of education had lower employment rates in New Mexico.



Chart 12. Net Migration of State Populations To/(From) New Mexico, 2009-2018



^{2009 2010 2011 2012 2013 2014 2015 2016 2017 2018} Source: LFC analysis of U.S. Census Bureau data.

In 2018, the Colorado General Assembly passed legislation requiring an annual report describing the employment and wage outcomes of the state's college graduates Over half of Colorado's college graduates from 2004 through 2014 worked in Colorado 5 years after graduation. In 2018, the Colorado General Assembly passed legislation requiring the Colorado Department of Higher Education to produce an annual higher education "return on investment" report describing, among other metrics, the employment and wage outcomes of the state's college graduates.⁹ According to the 2020 report, 51 percent of Colorado's total college graduates

from 2004 through 2014 still worked in Colorado 5 years after initial graduation.

In New Mexico, HED has the capability to match its college graduate data with Workforce Solutions Department (WSD) state unemployment insurance wage data and has sometimes provided matched selected datasets to LFC staff for program evaluations.¹⁰ However, HED does not produce these matched datasets each year or regularly publish reports on New Mexico college

Chart 13. Median Wages of Colorado College Graduates 1-, 5-, and 10- years after Graduation

| Certificate < 1 yr | \$32,463 \$40,639 \$48,177 | Median Wage |
|------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------|
| Certificate 1-2 yr | \$40,646 \$48,961 \$57,044 | After 1-Year |
| Associate of Applied Science | \$45,078 \$53,271 \$60,603 | After 5-Years |
| Associate of General Studies | \$35,211 \$43,456 \$49,364 | After 10-Years |
| Associate Degree (AA or AS) | \$30,270 \$41,410 \$47,532 | |
| Bachelor's Degree | \$38,678 \$50,663 \$62,083 | |

Source: Colorado Department of Higher Education. (2020). "Annual Return on Investment Report." p.10. Note: Cohort for 1-Year consists of graduates from 2004-2018, Cohort for 5-years consists of graduates from 2004-2014; Cohort for 10-years consists of graduates from 2004-2009.

⁸ New Mexico Workforce Solutions Department. (2020) 2020 State of the Workforce Report. p.8. Retrieved from <u>https://www.dws.state.nm.us/Portals/0/DM/LMI/NM_2020_SOTW_Report.pdf</u> ⁹ House Bill 18-1226.

¹⁰ Legislative Finance Committee. (2020). "Program Evaluation: Nursing Expansion and the Workforce." Report #20-03. p.23; Legislative Finance Committee (2016) "Program Evaluation: Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) Degree Production and Employment Outcomes." Report #16-05. p.9.

graduate employment and wage outcomes. Such data could help policymakers and HEIs inform students about future career options and connect college graduates to jobs in New Mexico. A recent 2020 LFC Policy Spotlight report on the New Mexico workforce identified the need for this type of analysis and planning for a faster economic recovery.¹¹

For FY21, the Legislature appropriated \$274 thousand to HED from the state Computer Systems Enhancement Fund for the purpose of initiating a statewide longitudinal data system. According to a project summary document on the HED website, an interagency memorandum of understanding (MOU) between HED, WSD, the Public Education Department (PED), and the Early Childhood Education and Care Department (ECECD) will be signed by December 2020. The vendor request for proposal (RFP) process is scheduled for completion in 2021.

Raising New Mexico's Competitiveness in Higher Education: **Data-Driven Performance Management**

Student outcomes in New Mexico lag surrounding states, despite strong state investments into the operating and capital infrastructure of New Mexico's 24 statefunded colleges and universities. Managing for results at HEIs is constrained by a system where accountability is dispersed among a decentralized governing structure,¹² at HEIs who compete, rather than collaborate with each other. The statewide entity charged with higher education oversight, HED, has been minimized by limited staff and institutional capabilities.

In statute, HED is responsible for providing information on the performance of the system. With limited resources, HED relies on the colleges and universities to submit data routinely. HED aggregates the data to provide summative reports. Most reports provide data on inputs: enrollment, awards, and finances.

The colleges collect even more data than submitted to HED. It is being collected on a real-time basis every semester: the number of students enrolled, the number of classes a student completes, a student's academic performance in those classes, a student's success in progressing through their degree plan, a student's financial history, number of faculty, course size and scheduling, course fail rates, and other data.

Higher education staff are occupied with complying with

federal reporting requirements rather than evaluating or assessing student outcomes. The deluge of reporting - and the labyrinth of databases and processes created for compliance - has obscured its informational value. As a result, the Legislature invests in programs aimed at improving student outcomes, but receives limited data or timely information to understand the worth of the programs. Providing a more comprehensive picture of student success throughout the year, which is the outcome of higher education, requires a deeper dive into the data captured by colleges and universities. The state and HEIs recently approved a

¹¹ Legislative Finance Committee (2020). "Policy Spotlight: Workforce Development Post COVID-19 Pandemic." p.16. Retrieved from https://www.nmlegis.gov/Entity/LFC/Documents/Program_Evaluation_Reports/Spotlight%20-%20Workforce%20Development%20Post%20Covid-19%20Pandemic.pdf

¹² HED. (2018). "The New Mexico Higher Education Governance Report." p.5

The Legislature appropriated \$274 thousand to HED for the initiation a statewide longitudinal data system; The vendor request for proposal process is scheduled for completion in 2021



Figure 2. Data-Driven Performance Management

College administrators have the opportunity to mine their databases to identify and produce meaningful information about student success major redesign of higher education performance reporting for the state Accountability in Government Act (AGA), which will provide eight categories of performance data on a tri-semester schedule to higher education stakeholders.

The Legislature, HED, and HEIs need clear, comprehensive information on college performance and student outcomes. More importantly, college administrators – who have access to troves of data – have the opportunity to mine their databases to identify and produce meaningful information about student success. Leaders in higher education, who shift from a mindset of data-management-for-compliance to data-mining-for-business-intelligence, will disrupt and innovate on college campuses.

Appendix A. Higher Education Glossary

CCC: Clovis Community College CNM: Central New Mexico Community College CUP: New Mexico Council of University Presidents **ENMU:** Eastern New Mexico University **ENMU-RO:** Eastern New Mexico University-Roswell ENMU-RUI: Eastern New Mexico University Ruidoso **HED:** Higher Education Department **HEI:** Higher Education Institution **I&G:** Instruction and General Budget Category LCC: Luna Community College MCC: Mesalands Community College NMACC: New Mexico Association of Community Colleges NMICC: New Mexico Independent Community Colleges **NMHU:** New Mexico Highlands University **NMJC:** New Mexico Junior College **NNMC:** Northern New Mexico College **NMSU:** New Mexico State University NMSU-AL: New Mexico State University-Alamogordo NMSU-CA: New Mexico State University-Carlsbad NMSU-DA: New Mexico State University-Doña Ana NMSU-GR: New Mexico State University-Grants **NMT:** New Mexico Institute of Mining and Technology **RPSP:** Research and Public Service Project SFCC: Santa Fe Community College SJC: San Juan College **UNM:** University of New Mexico UNM-GA: University of New Mexico-Gallup **UNM-LA:** University of New Mexico-Los Alamos **UNM-TA:** University of New Mexico-Taos UNM-VA: University of New Mexico-Valencia UNM HSC: University of New Mexico Health Sciences Center **WNMU:** Western New Mexico University

Appendix B. New Mexico State-Funded Higher Education Institution Student Enrollment, Headcount



Source: HED eDear reports from HEIs. Note: Data does not include dual credit students.

Appendix C. Top High Schools Feeding UNM Freshman Class Enrollment, Fall Semester

| High School | 2010 | 2011 | 2012 | 2013 | 2014 | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | 2018 |
|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| La Cueva High School | 180 | 220 | 149 | 173 | 155 | 162 | 152 | 137 | 130 |
| V Sue Cleveland High School | - | 121 | 127 | 136 | 129 | 141 | 120 | 111 | 119 |
| Volcano Vista High School | 86 | 129 | 134 | 170 | 122 | 143 | 131 | 138 | 109 |
| Cibola High School | 169 | 116 | 120 | 105 | 112 | 110 | 95 | 128 | 102 |
| Eldorado High School | 168 | 144 | 140 | 145 | 148 | 123 | 128 | 110 | 101 |
| Rio Rancho High School | 233 | 125 | 110 | 117 | 103 | 135 | 137 | 107 | 99 |
| Albuquerque High School | 101 | 107 | 81 | 69 | 84 | 93 | 80 | 104 | 90 |
| Sandia High School | 173 | 136 | 127 | 139 | 95 | 118 | 105 | 136 | 84 |
| Atrisco Heritage Academy High School | - | - | 137 | 136 | 69 | 93 | 94 | 83 | 77 |
| Saint Pius X High School | 111 | 94 | 90 | 92 | 58 | 81 | 62 | 75 | 64 |
| Manzano High School | 125 | 92 | 103 | 108 | 82 | 98 | 95 | 74 | 60 |
| Santa Fe High School | 75 | 55 | 46 | 41 | 44 | 47 | 56 | - | 49 |
| Los Lunas High School | - | 40 | - | 42 | - | - | - | - | - |
| Highland High School | 90 | 80 | 55 | 68 | 60 | 43 | - | 43 | - |
| Hope Christian School | 53 | 45 | 41 | 70 | 52 | 62 | - | 41 | - |
| Los Alamos High School | 66 | 47 | 43 | 54 | 50 | 43 | - | 41 | - |
| Rio Grande High School | 49 | 59 | - | 42 | - | - | 53 | - | - |
| Saint Michaels High School | 43 | 47 | 48 | - | 48 | - | - | - | - |
| Valley High School | 99 | 66 | 52 | 82 | 52 | 45 | 62 | 49 | - |
| West Mesa High School | 96 | 98 | 55 | 43 | 57 | 47 | 59 | 50 | - |
| GED - Other | - | - | 49 | - | 43 | - | - | - | - |
| Moriarty High School | - | - | 41 | 53 | 44 | - | - | - | - |
| Del Norte High School | 70 | 51 | 58 | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Top High School Totals | 1,987 | 1,872 | 1,806 | 1,885 | 1,607 | 1,584 | 1,429 | 1,427 | 1,084 |
| Freshman Class: NM Resident Total | 3,137 | 2,910 | 2,945 | 3,069 | 2,656 | 2,793 | 2,708 | 2,630 | 2,179 |
| Freshman Class: Out-of-state total | 467 | 440 | 479 | 449 | 476 | 534 | 694 | 589 | 474 |
| Total Freshman Class | 3,604 | 3,350 | 3,424 | 3,518 | 3,132 | 3,327 | 3,402 | 3,219 | 2,653 |
| Top High School as % of NM Residents | 63.3% | 64.3% | 61.3% | 61.4% | 60.5% | 56.7% | 52.8% | 54.3% | 49.7% |
| Top High School as % of Total Freshman Class | 55.1% | 55.9% | 52.7% | 53.6% | 51.3% | 47.6% | 42.0% | 44.3% | 40.9% |

Top High Schools Feeding UNM Freshman Class (enrollment greater than 40 students) - Fall Semester

Source: UNM Office of Institutional Analytics, Official Fall Enrollment Reports

| ₽ | FY07 | FY08 | FY09 | FY10 | FY11 | FY12 | FY13 | FY14 | FY15 | FY16 | FY17 | FY18 | FY19 | FY20 |
|-------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|------------------|--|------------------|
| ccc | \$1,682,629 | \$1,941,286 | \$1,556,959 | \$1,446,892 | \$2,113,756 | \$2,270,734 | \$3,049,367 | \$4,259,959 | \$3,671,209 | \$4,284,222 | \$3,150,350 | \$4,538,248 | \$4,911,921 | \$4,488,924 |
| CNM | \$16,006,062 | \$22,381,390 | \$20,138,221 | \$23,022,164 | \$23,870,496 | \$25,280,805 | \$24,044,507 | \$15,635,281 | \$14,215,808 | \$19,816,002 | \$18,293,536 | \$21,699,699 | \$23,600,057 | \$29,068,292 |
| ENMU-Main | \$1,690,921 | \$1,948,912 | \$1,475,239 | \$1,397,897 | \$1,488,219 | \$1,489,092 | \$1,659,694 | \$1,681,856 | \$1,742,129 | \$1,546,887 | \$1,551,589 | \$1,767,766 | \$2,012,524 | \$2,217,630 |
| ENMU-Ros | \$1,146,060 | \$1,932,388 | \$1,447,957 | \$1,406,385 | \$1,070,805 | \$665,277 | \$1,417,826 | \$1,134,855 | \$1,571,595 | \$2,681,217 | \$3,303,179 | \$989,420 | \$1,468,995 | \$18,752,959 |
| ENMU-Rui | \$593,546 | \$816,933 | \$158,156 | \$278,003 | \$246,216 | \$496,207 | \$706,211 | \$1,315,126 | \$1,129,116 | \$721,237 | \$881,153 | \$848,466 | \$871,817 | \$1,055,414 |
| ГСС | \$2,990,473 | \$1,972,916 | \$2,149,824 | \$2,386,373 | \$2,863,032 | \$2,335,922 | \$2,125,844 | \$2,622,880 | \$2,988,362 | \$3,557,275 | \$3,817,129 | \$4,258,474 | \$3,481,112 | \$4,222,109 |
| MCC | \$1,007,919 | \$779,152 | \$752,108 | \$681,872 | \$1,247,357 | \$1,781,856 | \$2,691,643 | \$2,980,302 | \$2,879,873 | \$1,932,200 | -\$3,026,253 | -\$4,363,796 | \$1,203,084 | \$590,437 |
| NMHU | \$2,950,988 | \$2,738,736 | \$2,786,425 | \$1,042,332 | \$988,632 | \$1,265,140 | \$1,081,020 | \$1,323,465 | \$2,600,786 | \$2,654,008 | \$1,281,632 | \$8,619,981 | \$4,860,296 | \$10,746,510 |
| NMJC | \$7,677,237 | \$9,992,070 | \$11,170,919 | \$2,702,763 | \$1,721,686 | \$2,542,400 | \$1,119,040 | \$1,771,981 | \$2,303,331 | \$3,883,100 | \$3,906,855 | \$2,857,009 | \$2,526,681 | \$3,214,467 |
| NMSU-AL | \$701,200 | \$1,296,845 | \$2,102,797 | \$3,149,791 | \$2,467,394 | \$2,359,737 | \$2,141,383 | \$2,603,151 | \$2,762,884 | \$1,575,937 | \$1,731,256 | \$2,456,042 | \$1,818,049 | \$2,802,299 |
| NMSU-CA | \$685,030 | \$1,129,958 | \$2,522,471 | \$3,296,994 | \$3,160,997 | \$2,916,460 | \$2,999,857 | \$2,835,789 | \$1,895,826 | \$2,789,988 | \$2,134,622 | \$2,142,606 | \$4,315,539 | \$6,044,521 |
| NMSU-DA | \$4,092,951 | \$4,362,302 | \$4,799,306 | \$5,902,868 | \$5,843,041 | \$5,152,452 | \$4,334,685 | \$5,018,878 | \$6,035,374 | \$6,087,195 | \$6,483,154 | \$6,653,236 | \$7,768,706 | \$7,908,731 |
| NMSU-GR | \$355,608 | \$731,845 | \$675,302 | \$796,200 | \$1,073,185 | \$1,108,949 | \$1,311,618 | \$1,011,264 | \$1,173,582 | \$1,240,367 | \$1,270,040 | \$1,632,857 | \$1,455,135 | \$1,674,232 |
| NMSU-Main | \$9,375,830 | \$12,371,924 | \$13,342,273 | \$17,267,745 | \$20,534,189 | \$17,230,296 | \$17,835,680 | \$18,866,671 | \$19,586,920 | \$19,443,507 | \$17,873,541 | \$19,825,615 | \$19,401,724 | \$19,154,032 |
| NMT | \$5,261,833 | \$5,057,258 | \$5,826,770 | \$6,231,718 | \$6,554,730 | \$7,804,879 | \$4,569,880 | \$6,428,462 | \$8,227,193 | \$9,480,924 | \$9,641,178 | \$9,248,482 | \$10,791,443 | \$11,346,965 |
| NNMC | \$1,344,707 | \$1,317,355 | \$1,414,836 | \$2,126,531 | \$54,634 | \$468,374 | \$917,170 | \$3,553,298 | -\$650,883 | \$1,361,784 | \$1,624,125 | \$2,695,561 | \$2,386,930 | \$5,018,190 |
| SFCC | \$3,056,072 | \$3,553,941 | \$3,063,552 | \$3,248,424 | \$3,503,487 | \$3,249,000 | \$2,485,470 | \$1,500,517 | \$1,946,423 | \$1,582,997 | \$1,681,706 | \$2,246,185 | \$3,739,501 | \$5,483,637 |
| sJC | \$10,180,747 | \$11,066,341 | \$10,595,573 | \$11,254,566 | \$11,510,078 | \$11,398,728 | \$12,932,903 | \$12,397,174 | \$11,976,270 | \$13,328,818 | \$15,422,377 | \$18,329,408 | \$18,696,320 | \$19,828,499 |
| UNM-GA | \$2,101,489 | \$2,958,508 | \$3,612,488 | \$4,059,906 | \$6,214,701 | \$7,164,792 | \$8,124,135 | \$7,689,110 | \$6,601,447 | \$6,150,895 | \$5,336,533 | \$6,197,831 | \$6,795,805 | \$8,206,307 |
| UNM-HSC | \$3,017,881 | \$3,689,941 | \$3,596,963 | \$4,022,794 | \$3,598,690 | \$4,932,719 | \$5,090,694 | \$4,491,461 | \$5,594,765 | \$5,414,637 | \$5,937,611 | \$6,533,713 | \$6,605,335 | \$8,852,072 |
| UNM-LA | \$254,207 | \$381,696 | \$293,747 | \$486,738 | \$532,714 | \$246,866 | \$168,818 | \$182,873 | \$274,702 | \$419,466 | \$530,399 | \$1,031,645 | \$1,450,138 | \$1,873,350 |
| UNM-Main | \$13,837,166 | \$19,192,188 | \$17,565,207 | \$25,672,563 | \$44,222,581 | \$46,580,373 | \$38,133,299 | \$34,260,773 | \$32,010,398 | \$32,028,572 | \$31,119,350 | \$36,509,946 | \$43,017,738 | \$44,683,922 |
| UNM-TA | \$89,070 | \$307,089 | \$323,471 | \$629,205 | \$1,303,589 | \$1,893,955 | \$2,383,293 | \$3,118,134 | \$3,884,554 | \$3,874,824 | \$4,424,355 | \$4,796,629 | \$5,021,754 | \$5,816,340 |
| UNM-VA | \$1,096,543 | \$2,170,177 | \$1,890,579 | \$2,154,772 | \$1,522,214 | \$2,255,918 | \$913,364 | \$1,612,616 | \$2,099,245 | \$3,160,765 | \$3,240,850 | \$4,199,821 | \$4,673,853 | \$4,640,999 |
| W NMU | \$635,022 | \$1,316,456 | \$2,327,628 | \$2,943,513 | \$3,851,641 | \$3,767,067 | \$2,371,188 | \$888,205 | \$4,034,244 | \$10,681,844 | \$4,293,089 | \$4,666,687 | \$6,710,810 | \$8,066,219 |
| Grand Total | \$91,831,191 | \$115,407,607 | \$115,588,771 | \$127,609,009 | \$151,558,064 | \$156,657,999 | \$144,608,589 | \$139,184,081 | \$140,555,153 | \$159,698,668 | \$145,903,356 | \$170,381,531 | \$189,585,267 | \$235,757,056 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | Source: L | FC analysis of h | Source: LFC analysis of HEI financial reports of actuals | orts of actuals. |

End-of-Year Unrestricted Instruction and General Fund Balances, FY07-FY20 Actuals

Appendix D. End-of-Year Unrestricted, Instruction and General (I&G) Fund Balances, FY07-FY20 Actuals

LFC Hearing Brief | Rightsizing and Reimagining Higher Education | October 28, 2020

Appendix E. Percent of Tax and Lottery Revenue Allocated to Higher Education FY17

Allocated to Higher Education, FY17 WY AK NM NC NM, 11.4% MS AL NE AR ND GA UT ТΧ ID ΤN KS ΙL HI AZ CA KΥ IN OK SC WV MT SD MD US, 5.8% U.S. IA FL MI LA WI OR VA MO DE WA MN OH NV ME СТ NY NJ со MA RI PA VT NH 0% 2% 4% 6% 8% 10% 12% 14% 16%

Percent of Tax and Lottery Revenue



Appendix F. FY20 Unrestricted Instruction and General (I&G) Revenues

| | State Fund | ding | Tuition and | Fees | Local Fun | ding | Federal Fu | nding | Other Sou | rces | Total | |
|-------------|---------------|------|---------------|------|---------------|------|-------------|-------|---------------|------|-----------------|------|
| HEI | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % |
| CCC | \$10,256,262 | 67% | \$3,076,761 | 20% | \$1,682,870 | 11% | \$7,322 | 0% | \$226,500 | 1% | \$15,249,715 | 100% |
| CNM | \$60,292,382 | 41% | \$25,339,432 | 17% | \$56,792,428 | 39% | \$38,230 | 0% | \$3,210,381 | 2% | \$145,672,853 | 100% |
| ENMU-Main | \$30,142,900 | 62% | \$17,038,480 | 35% | \$0 | 0% | \$71,628 | 0% | \$1,316,242 | 3% | \$48,569,250 | 100% |
| ENMU-Ros | \$12,143,500 | 70% | \$3,411,220 | 20% | \$1,153,014 | 7% | \$0 | 0% | \$576,230 | 3% | \$17,283,964 | 100% |
| ENMU-Rui | \$2,106,400 | 51% | \$486,660 | 12% | \$1,365,267 | 33% | \$0 | 0% | \$134,836 | 3% | \$4,093,163 | 100% |
| LCC | \$7,822,825 | 73% | \$708,358 | 7% | \$2,053,525 | 19% | \$0 | 0% | \$59,333 | 1% | \$10,644,041 | 100% |
| MCC | \$4,432,500 | 80% | \$742,454 | 13% | \$320,119 | 6% | \$0 | 0% | \$77,756 | 1% | \$5,572,829 | 100% |
| NMHU | \$28,839,899 | 67% | \$13,220,631 | 31% | \$0 | 0% | \$0 | 0% | \$1,002,722 | 2% | \$43,063,252 | 100% |
| NMIMT | \$28,656,334 | 58% | \$13,153,749 | 26% | \$0 | 0% | \$0 | 0% | \$7,981,125 | 16% | \$49,791,208 | 100% |
| NMJC | \$6,198,932 | 13% | \$3,983,573 | 8% | \$36,566,433 | 78% | \$40,923 | 0% | \$279,594 | 1% | \$47,069,455 | 100% |
| NMSU-AL | \$7,461,545 | 71% | \$2,159,750 | 21% | \$729,721 | 7% | \$1,920 | 0% | \$87,693 | 1% | \$10,440,629 | 100% |
| NMSU-CA | \$4,382,319 | 22% | \$1,212,582 | 6% | \$13,994,967 | 71% | \$855 | 0% | \$197,317 | 1% | \$19,788,040 | 100% |
| NMSU-DA | \$24,069,622 | 59% | \$10,571,465 | 26% | \$5,796,468 | 14% | \$5,507 | 0% | \$426,794 | 1% | \$40,869,856 | 100% |
| NMSU-GR | \$3,783,100 | 76% | \$794,221 | 16% | \$306,404 | 6% | \$330 | 0% | \$87,995 | 2% | \$4,972,050 | 100% |
| NMSU-Main | \$121,364,760 | 53% | \$87,376,098 | 38% | \$0 | 0% | \$178,291 | 0% | \$20,642,406 | 9% | \$229,561,555 | 100% |
| NNMC | \$10,687,200 | 66% | \$3,297,909 | 20% | \$0 | 0% | \$9,833 | 0% | \$2,288,923 | 14% | \$16,283,865 | 100% |
| SFCC | \$10,825,700 | 28% | \$6,730,460 | 17% | \$21,237,670 | 54% | \$0 | 0% | \$283,270 | 1% | \$39,077,100 | 100% |
| SJC | \$25,668,295 | 49% | \$11,018,175 | 21% | \$14,252,706 | 27% | \$0 | 0% | \$1,638,270 | 3% | \$52,577,446 | 100% |
| UNM-GA | \$9,479,002 | 60% | \$3,132,268 | 20% | \$2,380,021 | 15% | \$406,266 | 3% | \$272,297 | 2% | \$15,669,854 | 100% |
| UNM-HSC | \$66,614,676 | 52% | \$30,231,096 | 24% | \$0 | 0% | \$0 | 0% | \$30,552,078 | 24% | \$127,397,850 | 100% |
| UNM-LA | \$1,889,854 | 41% | \$999,171 | 22% | \$1,519,364 | 33% | \$87,040 | 2% | \$118,925 | 3% | \$4,614,354 | 100% |
| UNM-Main | \$196,138,500 | 53% | \$136,432,459 | 37% | \$0 | 0% | \$1,737,333 | 0% | \$37,301,416 | 10% | \$371,609,708 | 100% |
| UNM-TA | \$3,988,500 | 50% | \$982,874 | 12% | \$2,317,691 | 29% | \$173,258 | 2% | \$510,291 | 6% | \$7,972,614 | 100% |
| UNM-VA | \$5,899,632 | 53% | \$1,566,655 | 14% | \$3,132,764 | 28% | \$263,633 | 2% | \$275,441 | 2% | \$11,138,125 | 100% |
| WNMU | \$19,567,939 | 57% | \$13,352,162 | 39% | \$0 | 0% | \$9,580 | 0% | \$1,402,102 | 4% | \$34,331,783 | 100% |
| Grand Total | \$702,712,578 | 51% | \$391,018,663 | 28% | \$165,601,432 | 12% | \$3,031,949 | 0% | \$110,949,937 | | \$1,373,314,559 | 100% |

Unrestricted Instruction and General (I&G) Revenues, FY20

Source: HEI FY20 Financial Reports of Actuals.

Appendix G. FY20 Unrestricted Instruction and General (I&G) Expenditures

| Higher Education | Instruction | | Academic Su | oport | Student Sup | port | Institutional Su | upport | Operation Maintenan | | Grand Tota | al |
|---------------------|---------------|-----|---------------|-------|--------------|------|------------------|--------|------------------------|-----|-----------------|------|
| Institution | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % | \$ | % |
| CCC | \$7,007,242 | 50% | \$1,251,302 | 9% | \$1,545,866 | 11% | \$2,693,426 | 19% | \$1,621,253 | 11% | \$14,119,089 | 100% |
| CNM | \$61,675,431 | 46% | \$16,774,865 | 13% | \$19,823,276 | 15% | \$22,364,299 | 17% | \$13,136,745 | 10% | \$133,774,616 | 100% |
| ENMU-Main | \$22,969,767 | 54% | \$3,667,803 | 9% | \$3,445,890 | 8% | \$7,394,416 | 17% | \$5,063,267 | 12% | \$42,541,143 | 100% |
| ENMU-Ros | \$6,723,978 | 41% | \$1,175,875 | 7% | \$1,843,363 | 11% | \$4,295,059 | 26% | \$2,191,275 | 14% | \$16,229,550 | 100% |
| ENMU-Rui | \$1,198,905 | 36% | \$227,656 | 7% | \$334,918 | 10% | \$1,373,968 | 41% | \$193,121 | 6% | \$3,328,568 | 100% |
| LCC | \$3,649,707 | 38% | \$489,716 | 5% | \$1,631,176 | 17% | \$2,021,100 | 21% | \$1,895,682 | 20% | \$9,687,381 | 100% |
| MCC | \$2,174,170 | 41% | \$576,793 | 11% | \$668,809 | 13% | \$1,136,375 | 22% | \$705,131 | 13% | \$5,261,278 | 100% |
| NMHU | \$18,682,873 | 51% | \$2,457,244 | 7% | \$3,978,540 | 11% | \$6,480,470 | 18% | \$4,968,417 | 14% | \$36,567,544 | 100% |
| NMIMT | \$19,134,533 | 46% | \$4,774,059 | 12% | \$2,362,381 | 6% | \$8,598,349 | 21% | \$6,626,001 | 16% | \$41,495,323 | 100% |
| NMJC | \$9,367,672 | 45% | \$2,039,627 | 10% | \$1,839,102 | 9% | \$4,175,879 | 20% | \$3,495,674 | 17% | \$20,917,954 | 100% |
| NMSU-AL | \$4,630,386 | 50% | \$1,330,368 | 14% | \$737,579 | 8% | \$1,804,024 | 19% | \$845,078 | 9% | \$9,347,435 | 100% |
| NMSU-CA | \$4,309,666 | 47% | \$768,227 | 8% | \$1,024,944 | 11% | \$1,944,111 | 21% | \$1,107,093 | 12% | \$9,154,041 | 100% |
| NMSU-DA | \$20,990,584 | 57% | \$4,695,600 | 13% | \$2,788,392 | 8% | \$5,360,579 | 15% | \$2,967,743 | 8% | \$36,802,898 | 100% |
| NMSU-GR | \$1,607,914 | 42% | \$395,901 | 10% | \$509,232 | 13% | \$827,213 | 21% | \$515,153 | 13% | \$3,855,413 | 100% |
| NMSU-Main | \$106,637,370 | 59% | \$20,653,770 | 11% | \$12,566,249 | 7% | \$23,989,405 | 13% | \$17,534,830 | 10% | \$181,381,624 | 100% |
| NNMC | \$5,530,398 | 41% | \$801,334 | 6% | \$1,207,465 | 9% | \$4,216,189 | 31% | \$1,763,598 | 13% | \$13,518,984 | 100% |
| SFCC | \$16,014,052 | 48% | \$3,405,215 | 10% | \$3,346,884 | 10% | \$6,431,538 | 19% | \$4,207,051 | 13% | \$33,404,740 | 100% |
| SJC | \$26,242,596 | 58% | \$4,351,323 | 10% | \$4,826,173 | 11% | \$7,403,386 | 16% | \$2,428,400 | 5% | \$45,251,878 | 100% |
| UNM-GA | \$7,607,716 | 56% | \$1,300,972 | 10% | \$1,096,225 | 8% | \$2,124,007 | 16% | \$1,509,298 | 11% | \$13,638,218 | 100% |
| UNM-HSC | \$76,599,476 | 64% | \$8,722,884 | 7% | \$7,756,924 | 6% | \$18,468,572 | 15% | \$8,517,800 | 7% | \$120,065,656 | 100% |
| UNM-LA | \$1,564,513 | 38% | \$608,693 | 15% | \$507,164 | 12% | \$1,030,126 | 25% | \$355,308 | 9% | \$4,065,804 | 100% |
| UNM-Main | \$175,032,018 | 56% | \$42,875,075 | 14% | \$20,484,970 | 7% | \$43,820,534 | 14% | \$31,612,227 | 10% | \$313,824,824 | 100% |
| UNM-TA | \$2,663,606 | 39% | \$465,469 | 7% | \$704,105 | 10% | \$1,951,374 | 29% | \$1,039,197 | 15% | \$6,823,751 | 100% |
| UNM-VA | \$4,283,559 | 43% | \$1,277,802 | 13% | \$1,281,351 | 13% | \$1,965,712 | 20% | \$1,041,110 | 11% | \$9,849,534 | 100% |
| WNMU | \$15,424,432 | 53% | \$1,556,696 | 5% | \$2,669,363 | 9% | \$6,250,649 | 22% | \$2,976,958 | 10% | \$28,878,098 | 100% |
| Total | \$621,722,564 | 54% | \$126,644,269 | 11% | \$98,980,341 | 9% | \$188,120,760 | 16% | \$118,317,410 | 10% | \$1,153,785,344 | 100% |

FY20 Unrestricted Instruction and General (I&G) Expenditures

Source: HEI FY20 Financial Reports of Actuals



Appendix H. Comparison of Higher Education Access in New Mexico and Other States

| Comparison Category | New Mexico | Arizona | Colorado | Texas |
|--|------------|-----------|-----------|------------|
| Total 2019 Population Estimate | 2,096,829 | 7,278,717 | 5,758,736 | 28,995,881 |
| Total 2019 Population Age 18+ | 1,620,991 | 5,638,481 | 4,499,217 | 21,596,071 |
| State Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) | 24 | 29 | 31 | 108 |
| State HEIs per 100 thousand people age 18+ | 1.5 | 0.5 | 0.7 | 0.5 |
| Number of Degree and Certificate Programs | 1,951 | 4,012 | 3,962 | 9,362 |
| Degree and Certificate Programs per 100 thousand people age 18+ | 120 | 71 | 88 | 43 |

Comparison of Higher Education Access in New Mexico and Other States

Source: LFC analysis of U.S. Census, IPEDS, Higher Learning Commission, Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board, and HEI website information in September and October 2020.

Methodology: LFC staff collected the following information: total population, college age population (age 18 or older), the number of state-funded HEIs, and the number of unduplicated degree and certificate programs. LFC staff compiled 2019 state population estimates from the U.S. Census Bureau. LFC staff identified the state-funded HEIs of each state based on information pulled from the U.S. Department of Education's Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) in September and October 2020. LFC staff estimated the number of unduplicated degree and certificate programs in each state by compiling the number of degree and certificate programs listed for each HEI on the Higher Learning Commission's accreditation website and the Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board website in late September 2020 and early October 2020. Three state technical colleges in Arizona and Colorado were not listed on the HLC website because they had a different accreditor and, consequently, LFC staff compiled their academic program counts from their websites and course catalogs.

Appendix I. State Process for Approving New Higher Education Academic Programs

| N | ew Higher Educa | tion Academi | c Programs |
|---|--|---|---|
| Step in Program Approval Process | Approving Entity | Approves | Representation in Approval Process |
| Step 1 | Higher Education Institution Governing Board | Undergraduate and Graduate Programs | Higher Education and Executive Branch |
| Step 2 | Council of Graduate Deans | Only Graduate Programs | Higher Education |
| Step 3 | Higher Education Advisory Committee | Undergraduate and Graduate Programs | Higher Education (4 members), Executive Branch (4 members), and <i>Legislative Branch (1</i> <i>LFC staff member)</i> |
| Step 4 | HED Cabinet Secretary | | Exective Branch |
| Step 5 | Board of Finance | Only Graduate Programs | Exective Branch |

State Process for Approving New Higher Education Academic Programs

Source: LFC review of state law (Sections 21-1-24 and 21-1-26 NMSA 1978) and HED rules (5.5.2.1 and 5.5.6 NMAC).